

# VisIt: Experiences with Sustainable Software

Sean Ahern  
Oak Ridge Nat'l Lab.  
ahern@ornl.gov

Eric Brugger  
Lawrence Livermore Nat'l Lab.  
brugger1@llnl.gov

Brad Whitlock  
Intelligent Light, Inc.  
bjw@ilight.com

Jeremy S. Meredith  
Oak Ridge Nat'l Lab.  
jsmeredith@ornl.gov

Kathleen Biagas  
Lawrence Livermore Nat'l Lab.  
biagas2@llnl.gov

Mark C. Miller  
Lawrence Livermore Nat'l Lab.  
markmiller@llnl.gov

Hank Childs  
Lawrence Berkeley Nat'l Lab. &  
The University of Oregon  
hchilds@lbl.gov, hank@uoregon.edu

## I. INTRODUCTION

Visualization tools have long been fundamental to the process of scientific discovery. Nowhere is this more true than in the field of high-performance simulation, where data sets now run into the tens of petabytes in size. As the growth of simulation data has exploded in the last decade, so too has the need for scalable and nimble tools to provide insight into these complex results. At the same time that virtually all fields of science have seen data grow in size and complexity, the computing systems upon which simulations are run and data analyses are performed have become similarly complex. Parallel computing has become the dominant method by which scientific simulations are done, and visualization infrastructures have had to embrace this same method to continue to provide capabilities for scientific understanding.

VisIt was developed in response to these emerging needs. It is an open-source project for visualizing and analyzing extremely large data sets, while still exploiting the graphics capabilities of users' desktops. The project has evolved around three focal points: (1) enabling data understanding, (2) scalable support for extremely large data, and (3) providing a robust and usable product for end users and researchers.

In turn, these focal points have made VisIt a very popular tool for visualizing and analyzing the data sets generated on the world's largest supercomputers. VisIt received an R&D100 Award in 2005 for the tool's capabilities in understanding large data sets, it has been downloaded hundreds of thousands of times, and it is used all over the world.

VisIt's success has been wholly dependent upon the culture and practices of software development that have fostered its welcome by users and embrace by developers and researchers. In the following paper, we, the founding developers and designers of VisIt, summarize some of the major efforts, both successful and unsuccessful, that we have undertaken in the last thirteen years to foster community, encourage research, create a sustainable open-source development model, measure impact, and support production software. We also provide commentary about the career paths that our development work has engendered.

## II. FUNDING AND ADOPTION

Thirteen years ago there was a fundamental change in the way scientific simulation was being used, where ever increasing numbers of users were running simulations generating large amounts of data. This was especially true within the United States' Stockpile Stewardship program, and the heroic computational effort known as Advanced Simulation and Computing (ASC). It quickly became apparent the existing tools were not scaling to the size of newer data sets, and it was no longer feasible to have visualization experts develop and utilize a host of specialized tools to analyze users' data for them. What was needed was a robust, flexible, and general-purpose tool with which end users could analyze and visualize their data. A group of visualization developers were able to convince management at the Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory (LLNL) that what was needed was a new open-source tool, itself built with open-source software, that would enable data understanding while providing a foundation for implementing future scalable algorithms. Included in this mission was a mandate to provide a robust and usable product for end users. VisIt was born.

A small group within LLNL worked for the next several years to develop and polish this new tool. Using an Agile development model, the team released new versions frequently while working closely with users. This resulted in a popular tool for visualizing and analyzing data sets on the world's largest supercomputers and culminated in an R&D100 award in 2005.

External collaboration initially came from Sandia and Los Alamos National Laboratories. As adoption grew in the wider scientific community, VisIt received funding from the Department of Energy (DOE) Scientific Discovery through Advanced Computing (SciDAC) program as part of the Visualization and Analytics Center for Enabling Technologies (VACET). To enable visualization researchers and developers from multiple institutions to contribute efficiently, development was transitioned from a LLNL-internal model to a distributed model. This led to a period of growth in functionality where new state-of-the-art visualization and analysis techniques were added to the tool from institutions that were leaders in the areas of visualization and analysis, such as Lawrence Berkeley

National Laboratory, Oak Ridge National Laboratory, The University of California Davis, and the University of Utah.

This led to an even wider adoption of VisIt and commercial interest from companies such as Intelligent Light, Tech-X, and Allinea. These companies would either use VisIt to enhance their existing products or create new products using VisIt. They also contributed to the user support, answering questions on the mailing lists.

### III. FOSTERING COMMUNITY

VisIt is a general-purpose visualization tool, and it has been used effectively in myriad application domains: climate, astrophysics, turbulence, thermal hydraulics, engineering, computational fluid dynamics, medical, and many more. Thus, it has a large potential customer base compared to other HPC applications. As a result, more features and improved quality of implementation can lead to increases in “market share,” which can in turn lead to more funding opportunities.

This observation was taken to heart by VisIt developers, perhaps subconsciously. After gaining adoption in the ASC program, VisIt developers decided to make investments that would encourage adoption from new developers and customers. For funding agencies, the benefit of such investments is that they encourage investment by other agencies, resulting in either reduced cost for the same product, or in a superior product for the same cost.

The efforts to foster the customer and developer communities were different, and they are treated separately here.

#### A. Customer Community

For our project, every developer has played roles spanning from researcher to software engineer to customer support liaison. In the early phases of the project, the customer base was small enough that the primary means of user education was personal coaching from developers on tool usage. But, as user adoption increased, this model quickly became infeasible, as the proportion of time developers spent doing customer support would have grown with each new user. Making investments that scaled developer expertise to many customers became a good return on investment.

We discuss four methods for our support: traditional documentation, web support, education, and interactive support.

**Traditional documentation.** Our project has four main manuals. These manuals, by and large, were written by a single developer who recognized their need. Because of this, the manuals would regularly fall out of date, eventually attracting the attention of the user community. This would ultimately prompt a developer to refresh a given manual, which happened at the rate of every two to three years per manual. Our fundamental problem was that we did not effectively establish project norms that new capabilities and changes in the interface mandated corresponding changes in documentation. This was exacerbated by the fact that we did not move rapidly to open standards for collaborative document editing and publication. Going forward, we need to encourage our developers to feel shared ownership of the quality of the manuals and to develop processes where documentation updates happen regularly.

**Web support.** The primary face to our project is our web site. Surprisingly, googling the word “visit” has returned our project page as the #1 result for several years now. This project page provides access to the source code, pre-compiled binaries, and documentation, and is fairly static. The page is complemented by our “*visitusers.org*” site, which is an evolving site that provides a wiki and a forum. “*visitusers.org*” was started with the goal of being a community-based site where VisIt users would publish content and interact via a forum. We find that the VisIt community is often more interested with obtaining help than regularly contributing back to the community. One consequence of this behavior is that “*visitusers.org*” has effectively become a repository for superusers—who often double as developers—for scripts and techniques that enable complex analyses. It also is a place where developers list recipes for doing certain types of visualization, complementing the more formal manuals.

**Education.** We have had two primary education activities: tutorials and classes.

We have conducted well over thirty tutorials, ranging in duration from two to eight hours, at venues geared towards visualization experts (i.e., the IEEE Visualization conference), high-performance computing experts (i.e., Supercomputing), and customers (i.e., the SciDAC conference). The tutorials were generally well received, but their role in increasing tool usage is not clear. The primary struggles with the tutorials are two-fold: (i) how to teach material to attendees with varying backgrounds and varying expertise with VisIt? and (ii) how to get significant material across in a short period of time? The contents of the tutorial has gradually changed over the years. Originally, the tutorial was paced most appropriately for visualization experts, and many of the demonstrations were designed to inform the audience about the capabilities of the tool. Now, the tutorial has many more beginner activities, and the demonstrations are designed to allow all attendees to have at least a few successful experiences with the tool.

The VisIt class is taught in a classroom setting where every student has a computer with VisIt pre-installed. Many classes have been taught in partnership with the DOE and National Science Foundation supercomputing centers (e.g., the Oak Ridge Leadership Computing Facility). In this format, an instructor goes through features one by one, and the students reproduce the results. The class has one- and two-day versions and has been very well received. The classes taught at computing centers appear to have a correlation to tool adoption. Unfortunately, in contrast with tutorials that can be easily offered at conferences, classes are a less traditional format for HPC tools. As a result, the class is taught less frequently and has generally only been taught at institutions who wish to provide training for their specific users.

**Interactive support.** Documentation and training are effective, but we have found that users often need immediate assistance. We created two mechanisms for this: mailing lists for the general user community and priority support for our paying customers.

We feel the “users” mailing list has been very effective.

Any user may post, but users can only post if they also subscribe. Ideally, the users would be able to answer each other's questions. Unfortunately, this does not often happen, and developers answer many questions. This is partly because many of the questions are regarding compilation errors and crashes, and fewer are regarding effective tool usage. Nevertheless, we view the users mailing list as a success; it provides access to experts for all users, and expert support often comes quickly, which users appreciate.

For customer groups who financially support the program, we provide a higher level of support. First, we have a separate email list that goes directly to developers and gets priority. Second, we created a phone hotline that allows priority users to speak to an expert. We have found that these mechanisms have been well-received by our user community. Visualization is an interactive process, and the ability to receive coaching on demand prevents frustrating experiences.

Finally, as our developer community has grown, we have discovered that many HPC centers have a staff "expert" for VisIt who is able to provide direct local support for users of that center, then falling back upon the wider developer community as necessary. In the future, commercial companies that contribute to VisIt may offer paid consulting support to the wider VisIt user community.

### B. Developer Community

Our team employs software engineering practices that enable effective distributed support. We use a public Subversion repository located at LLNL for revision control and follow a model with a branch for releases and a branch for the trunk. We have a bug tracker and, for many bugs, we schedule the release for when particular bugs will be fixed. We run a nightly regression test, with results posted to the web, to catch any new bugs that might have been introduced. Overall, these practices appear to be effective.

In VisIt's early years, when all development happened within LLNL, the software systems that supported the activities of revision control, bug tracking, and revision testing were all done on internal systems with no outside access, sometimes on commercial software development platforms. Though these practices were successful, the need to embrace contributions from external contributors required us to migrate all of these roles to publicly-accessible servers and open systems. Though this process took several years, it is now complete and has proven valuable in nurturing our developer community.

The first five years of VisIt's development occurred with all of its primary developers within one hallway. This co-location was excellent for maintaining consistency in the code and very efficient for this team of developers, but it likely stunted developer documentation. As external developers joined in, documentation began to appear as questions arose from the new developers, primarily in the form of wiki pages on "*visitusers.org*." There is a mailing list for developers to ask other developers questions about how to develop code. This list has been successful, and we have found that all developers are eager to participate on issues where they have expertise.

We adopted a software plug-in model in the early years of the project and made the main VisIt code only be aware of the abstractions for rendering and data manipulation techniques and file format readers. We believe that new developers succeed most often when working on new plug-ins (i.e., new derived types of the abstractions for rendering, data manipulation, or file format readers), likely because they are protected from the complexities of VisIt's implementation and can focus on their own self-contained code. On the other hand, developers who must work on the main code face a steeper learning curve. In short, the software components we designed to be most easily extensible have been highly maintainable, but the rest of the code base, though still well-designed and modular, does not show the same degree of flexibility and independence.

We have found that the developer team grows by existing developers hiring new developers at their own institution and training them. Often, the project spreads to new institutions from developer migration, not from new developers at a site picking up the tool and learning it in isolation. This may indicate a failure in terms of fostering developer community, but we note that the goal is hard; learning how to develop a program that exceeds a million lines of code is difficult even with excellent documentation.

## IV. RESEARCH AND ARCHITECTURE

Understanding how visualization research is critical to the success of any future-looking scientific discovery effort, we architected VisIt to be amenable to a wide range of research activities. The plug-in model mentioned above is also critical to the transition of research into deployed software.

VisIt uses a "client/server" model, where the bulk of the I/O and computation occurs at the large HPC centers, close to the data, while the interactive rendering occurs at the user's desktop. This model allows for the easy deployment of remote visualization capabilities.

Internally, VisIt uses data-parallel pipelines for task- and data-independence [1]. Each "filter," or component, of a pipeline is by-and-large independent from any other filter, allowing for a vast array of possible data analysis and visualization activities to be applied to arbitrary data sets. This method has proven very popular, being the basis of a number of visualization tools over the last two decades. This independence also provides a fertile ground for research to explore a particular element of data analysis or visualization without having to implement basic functionality like I/O, rendering, or data model development.

## V. GOVERNANCE

The VisIt team at LLNL is responsible for ensuring that the software development practices are followed, that quality standards for the tool are met, that it passes the nightly regression suite, for setting the release schedule, and for creating the releases. Changes to the visualization infrastructure are vetted among VisIt developers via the *visit-developers* mailing list to ensure that they adhere to the VisIt design philosophy.

VisIt is funded by several stable long term DOE funding streams, including the National Nuclear Security Administration and the Office of Science. It also receives shorter-term funding for specific enhancements that are of benefit to small user communities such as the DOE Office of Nuclear Energy. VisIt has also seen increasing funding from other federal agencies like the National Science Foundation.

The VisIt project attempts to be as inclusive as possible and will allow most types of changes as long as it meets basic software engineering standards and doesn't negatively affect existing users. Changes that are localized to a small portion of VisIt that don't impact other user groups (such as new database reader, operator, or plot) are readily accepted as long as the code will compile on all the supported platforms. More fundamental changes are first discussed on the visit-developers mailing list to build consensus about the best way to make the change. The software architect is also heavily involved in this process. New VisIt developers are paired up with experienced developers in an informal mentoring program where they can learn about the processes and discuss changes to the code.

## VI. CAREER PATHS

We believe that the project's developers have benefited from their participation in the project. The majority of these developers were hired fresh out of college, and many of them had opportunities to rise above the individual contributor status within three to five years. One reason for this success is that there were several multi-institution grants, which created additional opportunities for co-PI status for the development team. Furthermore, each of the developers acted as the VisIt expert at their home institution and thus often had the first opportunity to pursue local visualization-related activities over remote VisIt developers who may have been even more qualified for the collaboration. We note that this contrasts with projects where the majority of developers are all at one institution and the lead developer at that institution attracts the lion's share of grant opportunities, speaking engagements, etc. Finally, we note that supporting a visualization tool like VisIt creates significant opportunity to network, as the large majority of the HPC community are potential customers. As a result, developers on projects like VisIt may have additional opportunities in terms of attending workshops, grants, and speaking engagements.

The discussion above represents our observations of the positives that assisted in career development. The obvious negative, for a research-oriented developer, is the additional overhead of developing high-quality software.

## VII. USAGE

As is the case with many open-source software packages, direct measures of usage are difficult. We rely upon the following mostly indirect metrics:

- *Usage statistics at individual sites.* At LLNL, developers collect information on VisIt startups on a per-user name basis and see approximately 300 unique user names launching VisIt every month. At most sites, however, we do not gather this information.

- *Downloads.* We measure the number of downloads of both source code and pre-compiled binaries. Our binaries have been downloaded over 200,000 times from more than 70 countries internationally. However, we cannot distinguish multiple downloads by the same user, nor can we distinguish downloads from actual use, whether routine or occasional. Traffic at "*visitusers.org*" averages over 35,000 visits per month, indicating strong interest from VisIt users.
- *User inquiries.* We measure activity on our users email lists as well as the institutions from which they originate. There are approximately 400 routine subscribers generating about 300 emails per month. Over the history of our lists, we have had regular communication with participants from over 200 worldwide institutions.
- *Citations.* We measure citations of the definitive VisIt publications. For example, according to Google Scholar, [1] has received 128 citations, [2] has received 35, [3] has 35, [4] has 31, [5] has 29, [6] has 24, and [7] has 23. These indirect usage metrics necessarily tell an incomplete story. However, the alternative — gathering information at every startup of user name and site — is impossible for classified environments where VisIt is used, and where such tracking is possible, it is distasteful to many users. The developers eschew these tactics in order to encourage adoption, but the price is a lack of more direct usage metrics.

## VIII. CONCLUSION

VisIt's thirteen years of development have seen a significant amount of success in deploying a scalable open-source tool that has been fundamental to scientific discovery for the nation. It has also shown a successful model for nurturing research and fostering its deployment into production for end user scientists. Though there have been stumbling blocks along the way, as is expected in any long-term effort, we believe that the lessons learned by the VisIt team can be instructive to software efforts looking to have similar impact and success.

## REFERENCES

- [1] H. Childs, E. S. Brugger, K. S. Bonnell, J. S. Meredith, M. Miller, B. J. Whitlock, and N. Max, "A Contract-Based System for Large Data Visualization," in *IEEE Visualization*, Oct. 2005.
- [2] H. Childs, D. Pugmire, S. Ahern, B. Whitlock, M. Howison, Prabhat, G. Weber, and E. W. Bethel, "Extreme Scaling of Production Visualization Software on Diverse Architectures," *IEEE Computer Graphics and Applications*, 2010.
- [3] H. Childs, M. Duchaineau, and K.-L. Ma, "A scalable, hybrid scheme for volume rendering massive data sets," in *Eurographics conference on Parallel Graphics and Visualization*. Eurographics Association, 2006.
- [4] O. Rübél, K. Wu, H. Childs, J. Meredith, C. G. Geddes, E. Cormier-Michel, S. Ahern, G. H. Weber, P. Messmer, H. Hagen *et al.*, "High performance multivariate visual data exploration for extremely large data," in *Supercomputing*, 2008.
- [5] T. Foyal, H. Childs, S. Shankar, J. Krüger, R. D. Bergeron, and P. Hatcher, "Large Data Visualization on Distributed Memory Multi-GPU Clusters," in *High Performance Graphics*, 2010.
- [6] D. Pugmire, H. Childs, C. Garth, S. Ahern, and G. H. Weber, "Scalable Computation of Streamlines on Very Large Datasets," in *SC'09*, 2009.
- [7] B. Whitlock, J. M. Favre, and J. S. Meredith, "Parallel in situ coupling of simulation with a fully featured visualization system," in *Eurographics conference on Parallel Graphics and Visualization*. Eurographics Association, 2011.